

Translation Shift Found in Gadis Kretek Novel

Ni Putu Puja Astuti¹, Putu Ayu Asty Senja Pratiwi², Ni Wayan Sukarini³

English Literature Study Program, Faculty of Humanities, Udayana University, Bali, Indonesia

¹pujaastuti184@gmail.com

²senja_pratiwi@unud.ac.id

³wayan_sukarini@unud.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This study investigates translation shifts in *Gadis Kretek* by Ratih Kumala and its English translation *Cigarette Girl*, translated by Annie Tucker. Using a descriptive qualitative approach and drawing on Catford's (1965) theory of translation shifts, the research examines linguistic changes that occur in the translation process from Indonesian into English. The findings identify two major types of translation shifts: level shifts and category shifts. Level shifts involve changes between grammatical and lexical levels, while category shifts comprise structural, class, unit, and intra-system shifts. These shifts demonstrate the translator's strategies in addressing systemic differences between Indonesian and English to achieve naturalness, clarity, and semantic equivalence in the target text. The study highlights the practical role of translation shifts in enhancing textual readability without compromising the source text's meaning. By illustrating how Catford's shift theory operates in a contemporary literary context, this research contributes to translation studies and offers useful insights for literary translators dealing with cross-linguistic and structural challenges.

Keywords: translation, lexical, level shift, literary.

1. Introduction

Social interaction in human life cannot be separated from communication, because through this process individuals can share information and build mutual understanding. Every form of communication involves at least two parties: the sender and the receiver. According to Chiavenato (2006), communication occurs when understanding is successfully transferred from one person to another. However, this process does not always run smoothly. One of the obstacles often encountered is language differences, which serve as the primary medium for conveying messages. Language, as an important tool for interaction (Wardhaugh, 2006), is a crucial point in cross-cultural communication. Therefore, to overcome this language barrier, translation becomes an important means of bridging communication between speakers of different languages.

Translation not only transfers meaning from one language to another but also plays a role in transferring cultural elements, norms, and social conditions inherent in the original text. Larson (1984) explains that translation is the process of transferring a message from the source language to the target language while considering appropriate meaning and structure. Several experts have categorized translation into several types. One of them is Venuti (2006), who divides translation into three categories: intralingual (within one language), interlingual (across languages), and intersemiotic (across sign systems).

There is a perception that mastering two languages is sufficient to become a translator. However, the reality is that the translation process is far more complex, as it requires the ability to capture and convey cultural context and implicit meaning. One important concept in translation is equivalence, which is the effort to preserve the meaning and function of the message from the original text in an appropriate form in the target language. This approach allows translators to create an atmosphere or meaning equivalent to the source text, even though they use different expressions or sentence structures (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1958).

In the process of transferring meaning and adapting cultural context between two different languages, translators often encounter various challenges, one of which is translation shift. According to Catford (1965), a translation shift occurs when linguistic elements in the source language undergo changes in form or grammatical category in the target language as a result of differences between linguistic systems. Given that each language possesses distinct structural and grammatical characteristics, understanding translation shifts is essential for effective translation practice.

This study focuses on the analysis of translation shifts in the novel *Gadis Kretek* and its English translation, *Cigarette Girl*. By examining the types of shifts found in the translated text, this research aims to deepen understanding of how such shifts arise and how translators adjust linguistic structures to maintain meaning, naturalness, and fluency in the target language. Catford's theory of translation shifts serves as the analytical framework for identifying, classifying, and evaluating the shifts that occur throughout the translation process.

2. Methods

This study employs a descriptive qualitative approach to investigate the types of translation shifts present in the English translation of Ratih Kumala's novel *Gadis Kretek*, rendered by Annie Tucker under the title *Cigarette Girl*. A qualitative method is adopted because the research focuses on language use, particularly on how meaning is conveyed through words, phrases, and sentence structures during the translation process. The primary objective of the study is to identify and explain the forms of translation shifts that occur in the target text.

The main data in this study are the novel *Gadis Kretek* in the original Indonesian version and its translated version in English. This novel is chosen because it has literary depth and

complexity of language structure that are interesting to be analyzed from the perspective of translation. In addition, the novel's success in becoming a Netflix series in 2023 adds to the relevance of this object of study in the field of literary translation studies.

Data collection was done through documentation study with note-taking technique. Both versions of the novel were read thoroughly, and sentences containing translation shifts were identified. The analysis in this study fully utilizes Catford's (1965) translation shift theory, which includes level shift and category shift, such as shifts in structure, word class, language unit, and grammatical system.

Data analysis was conducted through three stages: (1) identifying sentences that contain translation shifts; (2) analyzing the types of shifts that occur and the reasons for their use; and (3) evaluating the translator's strategy in conveying the meaning of the source language effectively into the target language. This study aims to show how translation shifts play a role in maintaining message accuracy and readability in the target text.

The findings are presented in an informal descriptive manner by providing detailed explanations and supported by relevant examples from the source and target texts. To clarify the presentation of the data, the examples are also arranged in a table displaying the types of translation shifts.

3. Findings and Discussion

1. Level Shift

Level shift refers to changes that occur across different linguistic levels—such as phonology, lexis, grammar, and semantics—when a text is translated from one language into another.

Number of Data	SL	TL
1	Gunung Merapi pun terlihat agung di kejauhan, itu adalah hari yang indah. (Gadis Kretek, p.76)	Mount Merapi could be seen clearly, standing tall in the distance. (Cigarette Girl, c.3)

2. Category Shift

As stated by Catford (1969), category shifts arise in translation as a means of preserving both meaning and linguistic consistency between the original and translated texts. These shifts are further classified into several forms, including structural shifts, class shifts, intra-system shifts, and unit shifts.

2.1 Structure Shift

According to Catford (1969), structure shift is one of the most common types of category shift found in translation at various linguistic levels. This shift occurs when the structures of the source language (SL) and target language (TL) are formally equivalent but differ in terms of grammatical structure or constituent elements.

Table 2. Data Structure Shift in Material Culture

Number of Data	SL	TL
2	Total ada enam nama dagang kretek baru yang dibuat Idroes Moeria setelah Kretek Merdeka!, ... (Gadis Kretek, p.137)	In total, Idroes Moeria had introduced six new cigarette lines after Independence! Kretek, ... (Cigarette Girl, c.12)

Data 2

This data shows the occurrence of structure shift at the phrase level. In Indonesian, the phrase **kretek baru** is structured with **kretek** as the head and **baru** as the modifier. However, in the English version, the order changes to **new cigarette**, where **new** functions as the modifier and **cigarette** as the head.

This change is an example of structural shift because although the meaning of the phrase remains the same, the grammatical arrangement differs between the source language and the target language. This reflects the difference in syntactic rules between the two languages and shows how the translator adjusts the phrase structure to fit the English rules without changing the original meaning.

2.2 Class Shift

Table 3. Class Shift

Number of Data	SL	TL
3	... ,melainkan masih dengan papan kayu yang harus dipasang satu per satu, dan anehnya kebanyakan dikelir warna telur asin lalu diberi nomor urut ... (Gadis Kretek, p.241)	... ,but with individual wooden boards that had to be put in place one by one. Most of them had been painted, oddly, in the colour of salted eggs and then numbered, ... (Cigarette Girl, c.17)

Data 3

The sample data above shows a class shift. Based on Catford's theory (1969), the phrase *papan kayu* in Indonesian consists of two nouns, *papan* and *kayu*. However, in the English version, the phrase is translated as *wooden boards*, where *wooden* is an adjective and *board* is a noun. This shows a class shift, which is a change in word class from a noun in the source language to an adjective in the target language.

2.3 Intra-System Shift

According to Catford (1969), intra-system shift is a type of shift in translation that occurs within the same grammatical system between the source language and the target language. This shift does not change the type of structure, but shows differences in the choice of words or forms of expression used.

Table 4. Intra-System Shift

Number of Data	SL	TL
4	Idroes Moeria tak pernah menyangka, mimpi buruk yang dikuburnya dalam sebuah kotak bernama Penjajahan Jepang, kini terulang lagi di usianya yang senja. Ia disiksa dengan cara yang menjadi kunci atas kotak ingatan bernama Penjajahan Jepang dua puluhan tahun yang lalu ... (Gadis Kretek, p.227)	Idroes Moeria never would have guessed that the nightmare of the Japanese Occupation, the nightmare he had locked up tight inside him twenty years ago, would return to haunt him again during his twilight years ... (Cigarette Girl, c.15)

Data 4

The intra-system shift in this sentence, according to Catford's theory (1969), can be seen in the phrase *dua puluhan tahun yang lalu* in Indonesian, which is translated as *twenty years ago* in English. This shows a difference in form within the same grammatical system. The word **tahun** in Indonesian is used in the singular form to indicate a unit of time, even though the number preceding it is plural. Conversely, in English, the word **years** is marked with the addition of the suffix “-s” to indicate the plural form. This reflects a shift in the internal system of each language, even though the function and meaning remain equivalent.

2.4 Unit Shift

Catford (1969) states that equivalence in translation can occur at various levels of language, such as sentences, clauses, phrases, words, and even morphemes. However, if no direct equivalent is found at the same level, then a unit shift occurs, which is a shift from one level of language to another.

For example, a word in the source language can be translated into a phrase or clause in the target language. This shift reflects the structural differences between the two languages and demonstrates how translators adapt the form to preserve meaning.

Table 5. Unit Shift in Gesture and Habits

Number of Data	SL	TL
5	Ibunda Roemaisa memandikan putrinya dengan air hangat sambil membisikkan doa-doa di telinga agar ia kembali menjadi seperti semula, sehat dan cantik meski tak ada lagi suaminya . (Gadis Kretek, p.80)	The mother bathed her pale and listless daughter in warm water, all the while whispering prayers that she should return to her healthy and beautiful self, even though she no longer had a husband . (Cigarette Girl, c.6)

Data 5

In the data above, the Indonesian phrase *meski tak ada lagi suaminya* has changed into a clause *even though she no longer had a husband* in the English translation. This change shows a shape shift from phrase to clause, which is part of category shift, specifically unit shift, according to Catford's (1965) theory.

This change was made to maintain the original meaning but at the same time adjust to the sentence structure in English which demands the explicit presence of subject and predicate. In Indonesian, the phrase structure is considered complete and can be understood in context, but in English, it requires the addition of grammatical elements such as the subject *she* and the verb *had* to form a complete and natural sentence. Thus, this shift reflects the translator's strategy in maintaining the fluency and readability of the text in the target language without sacrificing the meaning of the source language.

4. Conclusion

This study reveals that the translation of *Gadis Kretek* from Indonesian into English involves various translation shifts, including level shifts and category shifts such as structural, class, unit, and intra-system shifts. These shifts reflect the translator's efforts to preserve the original meaning while adapting linguistic forms to the grammatical conventions of English, ensuring naturalness and readability.

The findings demonstrate that changes in linguistic form—such as shifts from phrases to clauses or from nouns to adjectives—are commonly employed to maintain clarity without altering the core message of the source text. This study contributes to literary translation research by illustrating how translation shifts function in practice. Although limited to a single literary work and language pair, the findings provide a useful reference for future studies, which are encouraged to examine broader datasets and diverse literary contexts.

5. References

- Algeo, J., (2014). *The origins and development of the English language*. Boston, MA: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.
- Catford, J.C., 1965. *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (2024 ed.).
- Kumala, R., 2012. *Gadis Kretek*. Available at: <https://www.goodreads.com/book/show/13487229-gadis-kretek> [Accessed 1 Dec. 2024].
- Kumala, R. & Tucker, A., 2017. *Cigarette Girl*. Available at: <https://www.goodreads.com/book/show/13487229-gadis-kretek> [Accessed 1 Dec. 2024].
- Larson, M.L., (1984). *Meaning-based translation: a guide to cross language equivalence*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America.